

Monitoring and Evaluation of Decennial Education Plans: the production of knowledge in Brazil¹

Monitoramento e Avaliação dos Planos Decenais de Educação: a produção do conhecimento no Brasil

Maria Alice de Miranda Aranda*
Evally Solaine de Souza Rodrigues*
Sílvio Cesar Nunes Militão*

ABSTRACT

The main objective of this work is to carry out a balance sheet on the production of the knowledge related to the monitoring and evaluation of the decennial education plans, from 2001 to 2017, here understood as the National Plan of Education (PNE in Portuguese acronym), State Plan of Education (PEE – Portuguese acronym) and Municipality Education Plan (SME also in Portuguese acronym). For this survey, no distinction was made between the two generations of Plans, which emerged after the democratic Brazil of 1988 (PNE 2001-2010 and PNE 2014-2024 and the respective subnational plans), since it was considered relevant to reach greater scope in the research in order to contribute to the production of knowledge about the subject matter in discussion. This article has qualitative and quantitative approach and used exploratory and bibliographical research. The databases used were: a) Portal of Thesis and Dissertations of CAPES; b) Annals resulting from the national meetings of ANPED; and c) databases of the Electronic Scientific Library Online (SciELO Brazil). The results show that the production of national knowledge related to the 10-year education plans is still very scarce, especially when considered the exclusive focus on monitoring and evaluation

¹ Translator: Elita de Medeiros

* Federal University of Grande Dourados. Dourados, Mato Grosso do Sul, Brasil. E-mail: mariaaranda@ufgd.edu.br. <http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2561-7579>. E-mail: evallyrodrigues@gmail.com. <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6144-552X>. E-mail: scnmilitao@gmail.com. <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2094-1193>.

of the Plans. We conclude, therefore, that such focus is an open field and the fertile ground for further research.

Keywords: Decennial Education Plan. Monitoring. Evaluation. Knowledge production.

RESUMO

O escopo principal desse trabalho consiste em realizar um balanço sobre a produção do conhecimento referente ao monitoramento e avaliação dos planos decenais de educação, no período de 2001 a 2017, aqui compreendidos como Plano Nacional de Educação (PNE), Plano Estadual de Educação (PEE) e Plano Municipal de Educação (PME). Para esse levantamento, não se fez distinção entre as duas gerações de Planos, surgidas após o Brasil democrático de 1988 (PNE 2001-2010 e PNE 2014-2024 e os respectivos planos subnacionais), visto que se julgou relevante alcançar maior abrangência na pesquisa, a fim de contribuir com a produção do conhecimento acerca da temática em tela. De natureza quali-quantitativa, esse artigo lançou mão da pesquisa exploratória e bibliográfica. As bases de dados utilizadas foram: a) Portal de Teses e Dissertações da CAPES; b) Anais resultantes das reuniões nacionais da ANPED; e c) bases de dados da Biblioteca Científica Eletrônica Online (SciELO Brasil). Os resultados mostram que ainda é muito escassa a produção do conhecimento nacional voltada aos planos decenais de educação, sobretudo se considerado o foco exclusivo no monitoramento e avaliação dos Planos. Conclui-se, portanto, que tal foco de abordagem constituiu-se num campo aberto e fértil para novas pesquisas.

Palavras-chave: Plano Decenal de Educação. Monitoramento. Avaliação. Produção do conhecimento.

Introduction

Public policies cycle might be understood as a sequential logic of didactic purposes, composed by the following steps: 1st) organization agenda; 2nd) formulation agenda; 3rd) implementation; 4th) evaluation; 5th) finishing (PALUMBO, 1994). However, in the practice plan, such steps are connected, and they are not regularly sequential. For example, at the same time an idea is considered to compose the governments' agenda, it may be evaluated whether the pursuit is feasible in fact, coexisting two moments of a cycle (organization agenda and evaluation).

Evaluation step may be present in the three first moments of policies cycle, contributing to (re) think about a public policy. This step is fragmented in three parts, namely: 1) **policy analysis** (it occurs before the definitive decision making on a policy. Essential knowledge for these studies is on economy, mathematics and statistics); 2) **process analysis** (it focuses on the process by which policies are translated in programs and how they are administered. The subjects underlying this study correspond to political Science and public administration); 3) **program evaluation** (it is restricted to the post-decision step which tries to determine whether a program is reaching its goals, what the program is carrying out and who benefits from it. It considers studies from the psychology and sociology areas) (PALUMBO, 1994).

Evaluating a policy, both in its implementation process, which may be understood as monitoring the life of a policy, and verifying its outspreads and impacts when finishing the step correspond to essential actions for a policy success. The opposite is also real, in other words, the lack of periodic evaluation mechanisms and the absence or barely existence of evaluation practices contribute negatively to a public policy success.

Considering the relevance of this policy cycle step, this work aims at presenting a survey on the production of knowledge regarding monitoring and evaluation of education decennial plans, understood here as the National Education Plan (PNE in Portuguese acronym), State Education Plan (PEE – Portuguese acronym) and Municipal Education Plan (PME also in Portuguese acronym).

In order to reach a broader search, two generation of plans are considered, after Democratic Brazil – 1988 (PNE 2001-2010 and PNE 2014-2024 and the respective subnational plans), as well as a temporal clipping covering the entire historical period from the promulgation of the first PNE to the present cover.

Therefore, the state of knowledge about the scientific production contained in the CAPES Thesis and Dissertation Portal is addressed, also in the Annals of ANPED national meetings and in Online Electronic Scientific Library (SciELO Brazil) database, in the period from 2001 to 2017.

For presentation purpose, the issue is structured in four sections. The first one approaches the Brazilian educational plan in a historical perspective. Next, it presents and discusses the production of knowledge on the decennial plan. The third section deals specifically with the scientific production mapping regarding the monitoring and evaluation of decennial plans. Lastly, final considerations are presented, where some notes are described regarding the possible research focuses which may be studied from the gaps verified in the productions analyzed.

National education planning policy

The idea of an education plan of “[...] State, further the governments with national dimension, responsibility of all the federated entities and approaching different education levels and stages” (BORDIGNON, 2009, p. 91), despite dating back to the 1930s – whose historical landmark is the “New Education Pioneers Manifest” – and advocated by important legal diplomas, always found strong obstacles for its effective materialization in the country as public policy. As Dourado (2017, p. 12) points:

[...] the relation between the proposition and approval is not linear to its materialization process as public policy. In other words, PNE materialization implies actions and policies which are effective from several clashes and conjunctures, which contribute to the plan realization or put it in a second plan.

An evidence of the little tradition of the Brazilian state to guide our education through long-term educational planning is that

Only in 1988, with the approval of our Federal Constitution, the Union was obliged to draw up a law establishing a multiannual duration National Education Plan (art. 214), after redefined as decennial, with the aim at articulating the national education system (EC 59/2009). The first decennial education plan in Brazil was born then in 2001 by the Law 10,172, January 9th 2001 (NASCIMENTO; GROSSI JÚNIOR; PEREIRA, 2017, p. 110).

Regarding the elaboration process and approval of the Brazilian first National Education Plan (PNE in Portuguese acronym) instituted by specific law, Scaff and Oliveira (2018, p. 143) assert:

The first PNE elaborated under the aegis of the 1988 Federal Constitution was marked by a wide participation of Brazilian society, through two National Education Congresses (CONED) and wide debates held across the country, coordinated by National Forum in Defense of the

Public School (FNDEP). However, the Project elaborated by the Brazilian failed because it challenged the ongoing federal government neoliberal project. After a long debates and confrontations, the document approved and sanctioned by Law number 10,172, d January 9th 2001 (BRASIL, 2001) remained committed to the budgetary constraints that prevented the achievement of its goals.

When evaluating PNE 2001-2010 already expired, Dourado (2010, p. 685) points the limits for its concretizations, which are from “[...] restrictions to the education management and financing, because of nine presidential vetoes to what was outlined”, what configures a “formal plan, marked by absence of financing concrete mechanisms”. Thereunto, it was not made effective as guiding for policies, planning and management of national education. An example is on the reduced number of state and municipal education plans approved due to such PNE, despite it being a legal requirement.

Internal organicity needy, exaggerated as to the number of set goals – 297 in total, denoted “[...] a high index of dispersion and loss of distinction sense between which is principal and what is accessory” (SAVIANI, 2008, p. 275) and did not prevent concrete and effective mechanisms to the corresponding monitoring and evaluation of its implementation. PNE 2001-2010, in practice, did not was translated as a regulation mechanism able to “[...] lead the guidelines for planning, management and effectiveness of educational policies, as expected from a national plan that contributes to the federative pact” (DOURADO, 2010, p. 688).

However, despite all the problems, limitations and weaknesses of PNE 2001-2010, such Plans aroused the hope of civil society about the approval of a forthcoming Plan, notably its most democratic construction. Such wish may be observed in several works published near the end of the Plan 2001-2010 validity, among those we can indicate: Dourado (2010), Aguiar (2010), Di Pierro (2010) and Sampaio (2011).

Amidst this context of expectation to overcome the impasses in education and searching for a path for a social quality education, the Plan that replaced PNE 2001-2010 started to be elaborated from the end of 2010, taking about three years and a half for its processing and final approval.

Regardless the marches and countermarches during the long, disputed and complex processing, it was approved by the Law number 13,005, June 25th 2014 (without any veto from then President Dilma Rousseff) PNE 2014-2024, composed by 20 Goals and 254 strategies addressed to the all the teaching levels, stages and modalities, in order to represent a new encouragement in terms of educational planning as a state policy.

Differently from that occurred with PNE 2001, elaboration of the current PNE also advanced because it resulted from the broad participation of civil society, notably in the different stages of the National Education Conference (CONAE), which took place in 2010 and 2014. Other important advance is regarding the structure of the final document approved, leaner and more objective. To Saviani (2014) it is a positive aspect, because facilitates the PNE 2014-2024 monitoring process and evaluation.

However, in a contemporary scenery with significant political setbacks and impactful “fiscal adjustment”, whose greater expression was the Constitutional amendment number 95/2016 approval by an illegitimate and unpopular federal government by Michel Temer “[...] installed as a result of a legal-media-parliamentary coup [...]” (SAVIANI, 2018, p. 45), PNE 2014-2024 effective materialization is significantly compromised.

Thus, an “[...] effective mobilization and participation by the civil society and monitoring, evaluation and materialization policies of the new PNE (2014-2024), in order to constitute thus plan in an effective state policy for education” (DOURADO, 2017, p. 19) is imperious.

Considering the decennial plans relevance to design the directions of national education, the next section presents Brazilian production of knowledge mapping at master and doctor degrees and issues/scientific works from independent researches regarding the theme.

PNE, PEE and PME: production of knowledge in Brazil

This research is characterized as qualitative and quantitative (TRIVIÑOS, 2007), with bibliographic and documental character, because it is an orderly, analytical, descriptive and critical survey (TEIXEIRA, 2006) on the production of knowledge about the decennial education plans focused on the monitoring process and evaluation of this policy.

Such approach was chosen because it is consistent with the demand required by the object of study, as well as the relationship established with the researcher. Furthermore, this strategy was adopted because it comprehends an “inventor and descriptive methodology of academic and scientific production” (FERREIRA, 2002, p. 259).

The research started by surveying everything that was produced on decennial plans (PNE, PEE and PME) from 2001 to 2017, in the portal of theses and dissertations of CAPES, searched by the descriptors “national education plan”,

“state education plan” and “municipal education plan”. In the first moment, 582 results were obtained¹. Next, the works which really approached decennial plans as central matter were separated through reading their titles. When only the title did not make the scope of work clear, the abstracts were also read.

Thereunto, 85 researches remained from the universe of 582 works published in the portal of theses and dissertations of CAPES, from 2001 to 2017, according the Table 1.

TABLE 1 – DISTRIBUTION OF RESEARCHES FOCUSED ON DECENNIAL PLANS REGARDING THE TOTAL WORKS PUBLISHED IN THE PORTAL CAPES AND GT-5/ANPED (2001-2017)

Year	Quantity of works localized from the describers “PNE”, “PEE” and “PME”		Researches focused on decennial plans			
			Portal CAPES		NATIONAL ANPED	
	Portal CAPES	ANPED NACIONAL	Nº	%	Nº	%
2001	4	19	0	0,00%	1	5,26%
2002	7	9	0	0,00%	0	0,00%
2003	7	20	0	0,00%	0	0,00%
2004	7	21	2	28,57%	0	0,00%
2005	3	15	2	66,67%	0	0,00%
2008	16	16	3	18,75%	0	0,00%
2009	18	12	1	5,56%	0	0,00%
2010	26	----- *	4	15,38%	----- *	----- *
2011	26	22	3	11,54%	0	0,00%
2012	30	19	4	13,33%	0	0,00%

CONTINUE

² The searches were also performed on the website of the Brazilian Institute of Information on Sciences and Technology (IBICT), whose results were similar those found on the CAPES Portal. For this reason, further considering the limit of this issue, we chose not to present / detail the survey made on the IBICT website.

CONCLUSION

Year	Quantity of works localized from the describers “PNE”, “PEE” and “PME”		Researches focused on decennial plans			
			Portal CAPES		NATIONAL ANPED	
	Portal CAPES	ANPED NACIONAL	Nº	%	Nº	%
2013	43	17	5	11,63%	2	11,76%
2014	55	---- **	5	9,09%	---- **	---- **
2015	79	30	11	13,92%	1	3,33%
2016	102	---- **	16	15,69%	---- **	---- **
2017	134	23	25	18,66%	1	4,34%
Total	582	264	85	14,60%	5	1,89%

SOURCE: Elaborated by the authors. Notes: (*) Non available data to consult during the period of research. (**) Year in which there was not ANPED national meeting, which become biannual.

The data from the Table 1 show that after a triennium (2001-2003) in complete silence, only after 2004 the first researches at *stricto sensu* postgraduation level specifically addressed to theme decennial education plan started to be defended. However, the amount of works dedicated to the theme in approach remains very incipient until the early years of the next decade.

The very incidence of this theme on the academic production of the area is possibly related to the historical failure and low priority to guide the Brazilian education in face of the decennial plan and to the corresponding researchers' lack of interest in approaching such a theme. We highlight that only from the last re-democratization of the country (1988) that the matter of long-term educational planning takes centrality and materiality, ceasing to be a mere specter, especially after 2001, with the promulgation of the first PNE.

Still through the Table 1 we observe a large increase in the amount of postgraduation level works focused on decennial plans from the year 2015, what denotes a significant maturation of reflections/interest on the theme, especially after the CONAE editions (2010 and 2014). Thus, from 2015 to 2017, the production of knowledge regarding the theme did more than doubled, because there are 11 works published in 2015 and 25 researches in 2017. Notwithstanding such growth, even so, the amount of research focused on the educational

planning matter at the systemic level may be considered very small, a highly relevant theme, given the importance of planning.

The scarcity of research on the theme found in the CAPES Theses and Dissertations Portal is also observed in relation to the ANPED website, which houses scientific papers presented at national meetings. Following the same rigor and methodological course to survey and treating the data from the Portal of CAPES, searches were carried out in the website of ANPED, especially from the GT-5 (work group dedicated to educational public policies). The amount of works produced and published by GT-5/National ANPED in the researched period correspond to 264 issues, of which only 5 remained focused on the decennial plans (Table 1).

Table 1 shows that, despite the first work focusing on decennial plans published by GT-5/National ANPED in 2001, for eleven uninterrupted years (from 2002 to 2012) the theme remains completely absent from publications of the GT above.

This finding undoubtedly expresses the great lack of interest and little investment in the theme by researchers, especially those linked to the field of educational policy research, usually gathered in GT-5.

Data still show that the amount of works/publishing from the National ANPED meetings focused on the theme only takes momentum and constancy from the year 2013, reaching 4 in total until 2017. Even so, the scientific production on education decennial plans found in GT-5/National ANPED is small, including inferior – both in absolute and relative terms – to those registered in the Portal of Theses and Dissertations of CAPES in the corresponding period.

The scarce production of knowledge on decennial plans lead the authors to the initial questioning on the amount of researches addressed to the policy cycle steps, posteriorly by considering that from the theme “decennial plans”, other relevant themes to the education area emerge to be investigated. Thereunto, the distribution of works was by thematic categories.

Elucidating that such categories were not randomly created by the researchers is important, because they emerge from the central focus of works identified when reading the titles and abstracts of all the investigations surveyed through the research in the Portal of CAPES (85 works) website of National ANPED (5 works), which approached the plans as pivotal aspect.

The result of thematic distribution of works from master and doctor degrees may be followed through the Table 2.

TABLE 2 – DISTRIBUTION OF WORKS OBTAINED IN THE PORTAL OF CAPES, ACCORDING TO THEMATIC CATEGORIES

Thematic categories	Quantity of works
Elaboration plans process	34
Comparison between the plans	8
Implementation plans process	5
Management conception in the plans	4
Social Representation	4
Financing	3
Quality of education	3
Teacher training	3
Gender	3
Plans monitoring and evaluation	2
Right to education	2
Political conciliation	2
Other diverse thematic*	12
Total	85

SOURCE: Elaborated by the authors. Note (*): In this category are grouped 12 diverse thematic with a single frequency of appearance each.

Distribution of works by thematic category resulted in 24 different categories, in other words, each work analyzed when treating decennial plans as central matter approached it within a different thematic perspective. In some cases, despite the particularities in the research, there are recurrence themes. Thereunto, some thematic categories are highlighted in terms of frequency of appearance in the set of works researched, namely: Elaboration plans process (34), Comparison between plans (8), Implementation plans process (5), Management concept in the plans (4), Social representation (4), Financing (3), Quality of education (3), Teacher training (3), Gender (3), Plans monitoring and evaluation (2), Right to education; and (2) Political conciliation.

Considering that all the thematic approached by the researchers' present relevance to the education field, certain quantitative research imbalance by theme is registered. Thereunto, we may say that these themes regarding the contemporary education field has not been appropriately approached by researches in the area, such as education financing, quality of education and teacher training.

Regarding the financing education plans scope, we may assert that this theme has not yet been sufficiently approached, even more if we consider it is an indispensable aspect for the realization of long-term educational planning, which demands significant resources. Moreover, as Saviani (2008, p. 317) highlights, in a decennial plan, education financing is “[...] the goal of the goals [...], as it is the precondition and feasibility mechanism of all other targets.”

Other two central themes for Brazilian education advance that need to be more explored in researches on the plan are: quality of education and teacher training.

Quality of education is not a new theme, and it is constituted as a “[...] complex and embracing phenomenon, and comprehend several dimensions” (DOURADO, 2007, p. 9). Retaken it with greater emphasis is necessary “[...] in the scope of debates on education public policies, considering the place that PNE occupies” (ARANDA; LIMA, 2014, p. 308).

Teacher training, in its turn, is undoubtedly one of crucial dimensions that reflects on quality of education, because “[...] there is no education quality without teaching quality” (LEITE et al., 2010, p.102).

Qualitative imbalance also reoccurs when analyzing policy cycle investigations. We observe that the greater number of works is based on the policy formulation and elaboration process (34 works), followed by those which approached the implementation process (5 works). Lastly there are researches addressed to the monitoring process and evaluation of policies (2 works).

In the scope of works in the website of National ANPED - GT-5, we noticed out certain dissonance in some respects with the categorization of *stricto sensu* postgraduation studies.

TABLE 3 – DISTRIBUTION OF WORK FOCUSED ON DECENNIAL PLANS IN GT-5/ NATIONAL ANPED (2001-2017) ACCORDING TO THE THEMATIC CATEGORIES

Thematic categories	Quantity of works
Indigenous education	1
Plans historical constitution	1
Directors election	1
Teacher appreciation	1
Expansion of child education	1
Total	5

SOURCE: Elaborated by the authors.

Thematic categories that emerge from the published issues in annals of Nacional ANPED are proportional to the quantitative of works and differ from the categories contained in Table 2 - the only recurring theme is teacher appreciation². It shows that the focus of interest of this group of researchers is distinct from that coming from the CAPES Portal, which be understood as a favorable aspect. The reason is the focus on the decennial plans is broadened, producing knowledge on multiple themes about decennial plans and pointing to indicative gaps for other researchers to advance the discussions, enriching the study field.

Sparse works that are revealing for the educational field may be found from the 1920s, but it is only from the mid-1980s that academic productions intensify, as well as thematic diversification of works, thanks to the beginning of the expansion and solidification of higher education and postgraduate programs in Brazil (GATTI, 2010).

At the same time, researches in the public policy area has reached quantitative growth since the 1960s, a period in which the area of public policy has become a field of scientific investigation, due to a number of historical factors, such as the creation of ANPAE (1961), implementation of postgraduate studies in Brazil (1965), creation of education journals (1971), ANPED (1976), creation of GT 5 - State and educational policy (1986/1987). However, the real expansion of this research field was after the 1990s, with the creation of educational policy lines and research groups, of the subject educational policy, of journals in educational policy; and the strengthen from the 2000s, due to the growth of specialized scientific events and creation of research networks (STREMEL, 2016).

These historical facts point that research in education, in general way, have been growing in recent years and this growth, as well as the strengthening, especially in the public policy research field is very recent, which implies few productions in the area. A reflection of this is the small amount of research focused on decennial plans, even though it is a relevant theme for the educational area, as well as for the public policies field. It indicates that investment in research addressed to this theme is necessary, and it constitutes a fruitful scope of research.

In order to deepen the discussions on the production of knowledge about the decennial plans, next section deeply approaches the matters regarding the productions addressed to the monitoring and evaluation of public policies.

3 Thematic that in Table 2 is within the general category “Other diverse thematic”.

Scientific production mapping: decennial plans monitoring and evaluation

The act of evaluating a planning policy does not correspond to an isolated step, but in “[...] one of the components of the evaluation process” (KIPNIS; ALGARTE, 2001, p. 153). In other words, decennial plans evaluation should not be understood as an activity tight to the planning process, because one of the objectives of monitoring is verify possible blanks to present solutions, understand necessary adjustments and fully achieve the objectives.

Furthermore, monitoring and evaluation of plans become understood not only as an articulated instrument for correcting their directions by the government, but as a policy way addressed to accountability of governments to society with a view to knowing their performance or results, impacts and effects (DRAIBE, 2001).

Recognizing the relevance of monitoring and evaluation of education decennial plans, although lightly flagged in the PNE/2001 (Art. 3, paragraphs 1st and 2nd), gained greater repercussion with the PNE/2014. Article 5 of this document establishes the obligation of continuous **monitoring and periodic evaluation** of the Plan’s goals, carried out by the Ministry of Education (MEC), the Education Committee of the House of Representatives and the Education, Culture and Sport Committee of the Federal Senate, National Council of Education (CNE); and National Education Forum.

Due to the legal determination contained in the PNE / 2014 regarding uninterrupted monitoring and evaluation at determined time intervals in relation to the document’s goals, the states and municipalities also had to organize to establish their respective monitoring and evaluation committees of the Plans.

Because of the relevance of the monitoring and evaluation actions of decennial planning, in this stage of the research, we sought to collect data that met the criteria listed for further study, now focusing on the production of knowledge on monitoring and evaluation of decennial plans in their complexity.

Added to the localized results about the systemic planning policy evaluation stage on the portal of thesis and dissertation CAPES portal and on the National ANPED website - GT 5, the number of works was expanded through research undertaken on the Scielo Brazil digital website, equivalent to the period from 2001 to 2017.

In total, 4 works were found on the CAPES portal, 1 work on the ANPED website (focused on teacher appreciation, but in the bias of the PNE / 2014-2024 goals evaluation); and 4 works at Scielo Brazil. Once the material was selected,

the data lapping process was performed. Thereunto, readings of the works were undertaken in their entirety, not just the abstracts. The first reading had as main analyzing whether that production really could be inserted in the researched thematic. At the end of this stage, only 2 dissertations were excluded, because although the abstract appeared to be related to the decennial evaluation policy matter, the full paper content did not signal the same.

To perform the second reading stage, the authors created a reading sheet containing essential criteria to answer the investigation proposed, such as: identifying types of research (master degree, doctor degree, parallel research, etc.), database from, belonging theme, study object, temporal clipping, research focus, regional distributions, existing trends in terms of adopted research methodologies and notes of possible focuses of scientific investigation from the existing production.

Criteria listed to subsidize the analysis of the productions located in the CAPES portal, National ANPED and Scielo Brazil are presented in Chart 1.

CHART 1 – PRESENTATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF WORKS ON MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF DECENNIAL PLANS LOCATED IN CAPES PORTAL, SCIELO BRASIL AND GT-5/NATIONA ANPED

Title	Research type	Database	Theme	Object	Temporal clipping	Focus
Education Municipal Plan of Benevides-PA: monitoring and evaluation process	Master degree	CAPES Portal of theses and dissertation	Monitoring and evaluation of education decennial plan	PME/Benevides-PA	Non specified	Propose subsidies for monitoring and evaluation for PME pf Benevides-PA.
Participatory actions in the evaluation and monitoring of PME of São Caetano do Sul-SP	Professional Master degree	CAPES Portal of theses and dissertation	Decennial plans elaboration and monitoring	PME of São Caetano do Sul-SP (2015-2025)	Non specified	Analyzing social participation on elaboration and monitoring processes of local PME
Monitoring and evaluation of/in State Education Plans 2001-2010	Issue	Scielo Brazil	Monitoring and evaluation of education decennial plans	PEE's from all the federation states	2001-2010	Evaluation of PEE's in the validity period of PNE 2001-2010

CONTINUE

CONCLUSION

Title	Research type	Database	Theme	Object	Temporal clipping	Focus
National Education Plan evaluation 2001-2009: structural and conjunctural matters	Issue	Scielo Brazil	Educational Planning	PNE-2001/2010	2001-2009	Evaluation of PNE-2001/2010, political logic of its procedure, approval by the National Congress and Implementation Process
National Education Plan evaluation 2001-2009: matters for reflection	Issue	Scielo Brazil	Educational Planning	PNE-2001/2010	2001-2009	PNE/2001-2010 deployments for its realization. Evaluation in a general way of (failure) succeed of this document
Youth and adult education (EJA) in the national education plan: evaluation, challenges and perspectives	Issue	Scielo Brazil	Educational Planning	PNE-2001/2010	2001-2009	PNE-2001/2010 contextualization and evaluation of results making evident the goals for EJA.
Challenges for monitoring professional appreciation in the Goal 17 context	Issue	GT-5 National ANPED	Education decennial Plans monitoring and evaluation	Goal 17 of PNE-2014/2014	Non specified	Discussing the monitoring and realization of the goal 17 of PNE-2014/2024

SOURCE: Elaborated by the authors.

Through data surveyed and made explicit by the Chart 1, production of knowledge focused on monitoring and/or evaluation is still minimal. At *stricto sensu* postgraduation level, only two (or 28.57% from the total) researches are registered, both of master degree. The absence of investigations at doctorate level approaching the theme studied probably are related to the fact that Brazilian postgraduation offers “[...] many more masters than doctoral courses, with shorter duration and more vacancies offered, which explains the greater production of dissertations [...]” (SILVA; ALMEIDA; CAIADO, 2017, p. 865).

These researches, despite performed in different states (Pará and São Paulo), present similar characteristics, because both selected as study object the education municipal plans. Furthermore, these two works study a purposeful analysis, in other words, they search for signal monitoring mechanisms and plan evaluation.

Regarding the other searches found (5 or 71.43% from the total), they are scientific issues, and three of them make a general analysis of the document, and other two analyze specific goals of the Plans. From the total of issues found, only one of them is about the current Plan, other ones perform an analysis on the PNE/2001, what indicates the lack of studies published on the current decennial plan.

Table 4 shows the qualitative distribution of works produced that correspond to the theme, organized by Brazilian region.

TABLE 4 - REGIONAL LINKING OF WORK ON MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF DECENNIAL PLANS RELEASED BY CAPES, SCIELO BRAZIL AND GT-5/NATIONAL ANPED PORTALS (2001-2017)

Region	Quantity of publication
Southwest	4
Northwest	1
North	1
Midwest	1
South	0
Total	7

SOURCE: Elaborated by the authors.

Table 4 demonstrates that the greater quantity of academic productions published on the theme approached is from institutions localized in the Southwest region of Brazil, responsible by 4 (or 57.14%) production from 7 works surveyed in total. This high concentration of publications in the Southwest is because this geographic region gathers brings together most postgraduate programs and leads the country's knowledge production ranking.

Also noteworthy is the lack of expressiveness of the works produced in the other regions of the country (responsible for only 1 or 14.28% of the total works), the lack of academic production regarding the theme in focus in the South, the second most prominent in the country in terms of concentration of the national postgraduate.

Regarding the main methodological approaches, research tips and data collection procedures adopted by the analyzed works, Table 5 is illustrative.

TABLE 5 - IMPACT OF METHODOLOGIES IN THE WORKS ON MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF DECENNIAL PLANS DISCLOSED IN CAPES, SCIELO BRAZIL AND GT-5/NATIONAL ANPED PORTALS

Methodologies	Number of incidences in works
Qualitative approach	7
Bibliographic research	7
Documental analysis	7
Content analysis	3
Comparative analysis	2
Case study	2
Quali-quantitative nature	1
Empirical data analysis	1
Discourse analysis	1
Total	31

SOURCE: Elaborated by the authors. Note (*): The total frequency recorded is 31 because the 7 studies analyzed indicate the use of more than one methodological procedure.

Based on information presented by the Table 5, we observed that all the scientific production under study are grounded by the research qualitative approach, defined by Esteban (2010, p. 127) as

[...] a systematic activity oriented to in-depth understanding of educational and social phenomena, to the transformation of socio-educational practices and sceneries, to decision making and to the discovery and development of an organized body of knowledge.

The predominance of qualitative studies found proves, therefore, the growing “[...] interest that researchers in education area have demonstrated to the use of qualitative methodologies” (LÜDKE; ANDRÉ, 1986, p. 11).

According to information in Table 5, bibliographic research is also prevalent in the scientific production analyzed. These data are aligned to the nature of this research type, which “[...] constates the first step for all the academic activities” (ANDRADE, 2005, p. 39).

Regarding the data collection, documental analysis is the most frequent and stand out the other procedures employed. Its adoption is related to the fact that both may complement “[...] information obtained by other techniques [...]” and because allows unveiling “[...] new aspects from a theme or problem” (LÜDKE; ANDRÉ, 1986, p. 38). Other reason by its supremacy is probably because it is not possible monitoring and/or evaluate thoroughly assess the decennial education plans without carefully approaching them.

Final considerations

In the last seventeen years the production of knowledge in Brazil about decennial plans has been very scarce. From 2001 to 2017, only 85 researches at postgraduation level had as central object of analysis the education plans (PNE, PEE or PME) and only 5 works were published by GT5 from the national meetings of ANPED which deal the matter. In addition to scarce, such production is also characterized because it is recent, as most works were published in the current decade.

Whether considering only the production of knowledge focused exclusively on decennial education plan monitoring and evaluation, it is even more minimal. From the CAPES portal, ANPED (GT-5) and Scielo Brazil websites, only 7 researches which approach the decennial education plans monitoring/evaluation stage were found. These data show the lack of studies on the educational planning area, especially as regards the evaluation and monitoring of these documents.

Although the amount of research focused on monitoring/evaluation of the Plans is very low, the few investigations found bring important contributions to the area and raise new investigation points, especially when analyzed in the current context and following the demands contained in the PNE 2014-2024, such as the organization of committees to monitor and evaluate the Plans, as well as to propose public policies to meet the existing goals in Decennial Plans.

Thus, we believe that the decennial plan evaluation scope is an open and fruitful field for further research, especially regarding the process of monitoring and evaluation of the Plans, whether at federal, state or municipal levels. The need for studies that have the Plan follow-up commissions as the central object of the research is also highlighted, as well as the actions of the Government from the notes made by these commissions, in order to overcome the obstacles and reach the goals contained in the documents.

Finally, there is also the need for investigations within the scope of Plan evaluations that have a more specific focus, that is, studies that analyze, monitor and evaluate the process of implementation of specific goals, because according to the data, only two works elaborated in the period 2001-2017 focused on a specific goal (goals 7 and 17, respectively).

REFERENCES

- AGUIAR, Márcia Angela da Silva. Avaliação do plano nacional de educação 2001-2009: questões para reflexão. *Educ. Soc.*, Campinas, v. 31, n. 112, p. 707-727, jul.-set. 2010. Available from: <http://www.cedes.unicamp.br>. Access on: 21 out. 2018.
- ANDRADE, Maria Margarida de. *Introdução à metodologia do trabalho científico: elaboração de trabalhos na graduação*. 7.ed. São Paulo: Atlas, 2005.
- ARANDA, Maria Alice de Miranda; LIMA, Franciele Ribeiro. O Plano Nacional de Educação e a busca pela qualidade socialmente referenciada. *Revista Educação e Políticas em Debate*, v. 3, n. 2, p. 291-313, ago.-dez. 2014.
- BORDIGNON, Genuino. *Gestão da educação no município: sistema, conselho e plano*. São Paulo: Editora e Livraria Instituto Paulo Freire, 2009.
- BRASIL. *Constituição da República Federativa do Brasil*. Diário Oficial da República Federativa do Brasil. Brasília/DF: Senado, 1988.
- DI PIERRO, Maria Clara. A educação de jovens e adultos no plano nacional de educação: avaliação, desafios e perspectivas. *Educ. Soc.* Campinas, v. 31, n. 112, p. 939-959, jul./set. 2010. Available from: <http://www.cedes.unicamp.br>. Access on: 21 out. 2018.
- DOURADO, Luiz Fernandes. Avaliação do Plano Nacional de Educação 2001-2009: questões estruturais e conjunturais de uma política. *Educação e Sociedade*, Campinas, v. 31, n. 112, p. 675-705, jul.-set. 2010. Available from: <http://www.scielo.br/pdf/es/v31n112/03>. Access on: 29 out. 2017.
- _____. (Org.). *Plano Nacional de Educação – PNE 2014/2024: avaliação e perspectivas*. Campinas, SP: Mercado de Letras, 2017.
- _____. (Org.). *A qualidade da educação: conceitos e definições*. Brasília: MEC/INEP, 2007.
- DRAIBE, Sônia Miriam. Avaliação de implementação: esboço de uma metodologia de trabalho em políticas públicas. In: BARREIRA, Maria Cecília Roxo Nobre; CARVALHO, Maria do Carmo Brant de. (Org.). *Tendências e Perspectivas na Avaliação de Políticas e Programas Sociais*. São Paulo: IEE/PUC-SP, 2001. p. 13-42.

ESTEBAN, Maria Paz Sandín. *Pesquisa qualitativa em educação: fundamentos e tradições*. Porto Alegre: AMGH, 2010.

FERREIRA, Norma Sandra de Almeida. As pesquisas denominadas “Estado da Arte”. *Educação e Sociedade*, Campinas, SP, v. 23, n. 79, 2002.

GATTI, Bernardete Angelina. *A Construção da Pesquisa em Educação no Brasil*. 3 ed. Brasília: Liber Livro Editora, 2010, p. 14-41.

KIPNIS, Bernardo; ALGARTE, Roberto. Planejamento e avaliação educacionais. In: WITTMANN, Lauro Carlos; GRACINDO, Regina Vinhaes (Org.). *O Estado da Arte em Política e Gestão da Educação no Brasil 1991-1997*. Campinas: Autores Associados; São Paulo: Anpae, 2001. p. 151-171.

LEITE, Y. U. F. et al. Responsabilidades educacionais dos municípios e o compromisso da universidade com a qualidade da educação: uma experiência em andamento. *Nuances*, ano XVI, v. 17, n. 18, p. 101-124, jan./dez. 2010.

LÜDKE, Menga; ANDRÉ, Marli Eliza Dalmazo Afonso de. *Pesquisa em educação: abordagens qualitativas*. São Paulo: EPU, 1986.

PALUMBO, Dennis James. *Public policy in America: Government in Action*. 2 ed. Orlando/Florida: Harcourt Brace & Company, 1994.

NASCIMENTO, Gilvânia da Conceição; GROSSI JUNIOR, Geraldo; PEREIRA, Jhonata Moreira. Planos Municipais de Educação: perfil dos municípios que não possuíam plano municipal de educação no segundo ano de vigência da Lei n. 13.005/14. *Revista Exitus*, Santarém/PA, v. 7, n. 1, p. 108-130, jan./abr. 2017.

SAMPAIO, Carlos Eduardo Moreno. Monitoramento e avaliação do Plano Nacional de Educação. In: DOURADO, Luiz Fernandes Dourado (Org.). *Plano Nacional de Educação (2011-2020): avaliação e perspectivas*. 2 Ed. Goiânia: Editora UFG; Belo Horizonte: Autêntica Editora, 2011. p. 61-68.

SAVIANI, Dermeval. *Sistema Nacional de Educação e Plano Nacional de Educação: Significado, Controvérsias e Perspectivas*. Campinas, SP: Autores Associados, 2014.

_____. *Da nova LDB ao FUNDEB: por uma outra política educacional*. 2. ed. rev. e ampl. Campinas, SP: Autores Associados, 2008.

_____. Sistema Nacional de Educação e Regime de Colaboração. In: BRZEZINSKI, Íria (Org.). *LDB 1996 vinte anos depois: projetos educacionais em disputa*. São Paulo: Cortez, 2018. p. 27-46.

SILVA, João Henrique; ALMEIDA, Míriam Elena Cesar; CAIADO, Kátia Regina Moreno. Produção do conhecimento sobre as instituições especializadas para a pessoa com deficiência intelectual (1996-2015). *PERSPECTIVA*, Florianópolis, v. 35, n. 3, p. 859-886, jul./set. 2017.

SCAFF, E. A. da S; OLIVEIRA, M. dos S. de; ARANDA, F. P. N. Planejamento educacional e poder local na elaboração dos planos municipais de educação. *Quaestio*, Sorocaba, SP, v. 20, n. 1, p. 133-147, abr. 2018.

STREMEL, Silvana. *A constituição do campo acadêmico da política educacional no Brasil*. Tese (Doutorado em educação) - Universidade Estadual de Ponta Grossa. Ponta Grossa, 2016.

TEIXEIRA, Célia Regina. O “Estado da Arte”: a concepção de avaliação educacional veiculada na produção acadêmica do Programa de Pós-Graduação em Educação Currículo (1975-2000). *Cadernos de Pós-Graduação: educação*, São Paulo, v. 5, n. 1, p. 59-66, 2006.

TRIVIÑOS, Augusto Nibaldo Silva. *Introdução à pesquisa em ciências sociais: a pesquisa qualitativa em educação*. São Paulo: Atlas, 2007.

Text received on 07/23/2019.

Text approved on 09/16/2019.

